

Chapter 7. Correlated Errors

In this chapter, we examine the case where

$$E(\varepsilon\varepsilon') = \sigma^2\Omega \quad \text{could be non-diagonal.}$$

i.e. Some $E(\varepsilon_j\varepsilon_i)$ may be non-zero even when

$i \neq j$.

$$(1) E(\hat{\beta}) = \beta$$

$$(2) \text{cov}(\hat{\beta}) = (X'X)^{-1} X' \underbrace{\text{cov}(y)}_{\substack{\text{under Gauss-Markov,} \\ \text{cov}(y) = \sigma^2 I.}} X (X'X)^{-1}$$
$$= \sigma^2 (X'X)^{-1} X' \Omega X (X'X)^{-1}$$
$$\neq \sigma^2 (X'X)^{-1}$$

Generalized Least Squares: Case when Ω is known

Consider the usual regression model

$$y = X\beta + \varepsilon. \quad E(\varepsilon) = 0. \quad E(\varepsilon\varepsilon') = \sigma^2\Omega$$

- y is the response vector of n observations.
- X is an $n \times (k+1)$ matrix of known constants
- β is the $(k+1)$ vector of unknown regression parameters

- Ω is a known symmetric, positive definite matrix of order n .

Under these conditions, a preferred estimate of β is the generalized least squares estimator:

$$\hat{\beta}_{GLS} = (X' \Omega^{-1} X)^{-1} X' \Omega^{-1} y$$

$$y^{(\Omega)} = \Omega^{-\frac{1}{2}} y. \quad X^{(\Omega)} = \Omega^{-\frac{1}{2}} X. \quad \varepsilon^{(\Omega)} = \Omega^{-\frac{1}{2}} \varepsilon.$$

$$y^{(\Omega)} = X^{(\Omega)} \beta + \varepsilon^{(\Omega)}; \quad E(\varepsilon^{(\Omega)}) = 0; \quad \text{cov}(\varepsilon^{(\Omega)}) = \sigma^2 I.$$

Estimate of parameters

$$y = X\beta + \varepsilon. \quad E(\varepsilon) = 0. \quad \text{cov}(\varepsilon) = \sigma^2 \Omega.$$

$$(1) \hat{\beta}_{GLS} = (X' \Omega^{-1} X)^{-1} X' \Omega^{-1} y = \beta + A\varepsilon, \quad A = (X' \Omega^{-1} X)^{-1} X' \Omega^{-1}.$$

$$(2) \text{cov}(\hat{\beta}_{GLS}) = \sigma^2 (X' \Omega^{-1} X)^{-1}. \quad E(\hat{\beta}_{GLS}) = \beta.$$

$$(3) s^2 = \frac{e^{(\Omega)'} e^{(\Omega)}}{n - k - 1}.$$

where: $e^{(\Omega)} = [I - X^{(\Omega)} (X^{(\Omega)'} X^{(\Omega)})^{-1} X^{(\Omega)'}] y^{(\Omega)}$

proof:

(1) $S = (y^{(\Omega)} - X^{(\Omega)} \beta)' (y^{(\Omega)} - X^{(\Omega)} \beta)$

$$= y^{(\Omega)'} y^{(\Omega)} - 2 (X^{(\Omega)'} y^{(\Omega)})' \beta + 2 \beta' (X^{(\Omega)'} X^{(\Omega)}) \beta$$

$$\frac{\partial S}{\partial \beta} = -2 (X^{(\Omega)'} y^{(\Omega)}) + 2 (X^{(\Omega)'} X^{(\Omega)}) \beta$$

$$\frac{\partial S}{\partial \beta} \Big|_{\beta = \tilde{\beta}_{GLS}} = 0 \Rightarrow \tilde{\beta}_{GLS} = (X' \Omega^{-1} X)^{-1} X' \Omega^{-1} y$$

(2) $\text{cov}(\tilde{\beta}_{GLS}) = (X' \Omega^{-1} X)^{-1} X' \Omega^{-1} \overbrace{\text{cov}(y)}^{\sigma^2 \Omega} \Omega^{-1} X (X' \Omega^{-1} X)^{-1}$

$$= (X' \Omega^{-1} X)^{-1} X' \Omega^{-1} \sigma^2 \Omega \Omega^{-1} X (X' \Omega^{-1} X)^{-1}$$

$$= \sigma^2 (X' \Omega^{-1} X)^{-1} X' \underbrace{\Omega^{-1} \Omega \Omega^{-1}}_I X [(X' \Omega^{-1} X)^{-1}]'$$

$$= \sigma^2 (X' \Omega^{-1} X)^{-1} \underbrace{X' \Omega^{-1} X (X' \Omega^{-1} X)^{-1}}_I$$

$$= \sigma^2 (X' \Omega^{-1} X)^{-1}$$

$$(3) E(e^{(\Omega)} e^{(\Omega)}) = E(y^{(\Omega)'} M^{(\Omega)} M^{(\Omega)} y^{(\Omega)})$$

$$\text{ou } e^{(\Omega)} = y^{(\Omega)} - \hat{y}^{(\Omega)} = [I_n - X^{(\Omega)} (X^{(\Omega)'} X^{(\Omega)})^{-1} X^{(\Omega)'}] y^{(\Omega)}$$

$$= M^{(\Omega)} y^{(\Omega)}$$

$$\Rightarrow E(e^{(\Omega)} e^{(\Omega)}) = E(y^{(\Omega)'} M^{(\Omega)} y^{(\Omega)}) \quad \text{car } M^{(\Omega)'} M^{(\Omega)} = M^{(\Omega)}$$

$$= \text{tr}[M^{(\Omega)} E(y^{(\Omega)'} y^{(\Omega)})] \quad E(\varepsilon^{(\Omega)'} \varepsilon^{(\Omega)}) = \sigma^2 I_n$$

$$= \text{tr}[M^{(\Omega)} \sigma^2 I_n] = \sigma^2 (n-k-1)$$

$$\Rightarrow E(s^2) = E\left(\frac{e^{(\Omega)'} e^{(\Omega)}}{n-k-1}\right) = \frac{1}{n-k-1} E(e^{(\Omega)'} e^{(\Omega)}) =$$

$$\frac{1}{n-k-1} \sigma^2 (n-k-1) = \sigma^2$$

Theorem: Distribution of estimators.

$$y = X\beta + \varepsilon. \quad E(\varepsilon) = 0. \quad \text{cov}(\varepsilon) = \sigma^2 \Omega$$

$$(1) \quad K = \frac{(n-k-1)s^2}{\sigma^2} \sim \chi_{n-k-1}^2.$$

(2) $\hat{\beta}_{OLS}$ and s^2 are independent.

$$(3) F = \frac{(\hat{\beta}_{GLS} - \beta)' (X' \Omega^{-1} X) (\hat{\beta}_{GLS} - \beta)}{S^2} \sim F_{k+1, n-k-1}.$$

If we wish to test the hypothesis:

$$H: c\beta - d = 0. \quad \text{vs} \quad A: c\beta - d \neq 0.$$

H is rejected if

$$F = \frac{1}{mS^2} (C\hat{\beta}_{GLS} - d)' [C(X'\Omega^{-1}X)^{-1}C']^{-1} (C\hat{\beta}_{GLS} - d) \geq F_{m, n-k-1; \alpha}$$

$$S^2 = \frac{e^{(\Omega)'} e^{(\Omega)}}{n-k-1} = (n-k-1) [y' \Omega^{-1} y - \hat{\beta}'_{GLS} X' \Omega^{-1} y].$$

proof:

$$(1) S^2 = \frac{e^{(\Omega)'} e^{(\Omega)}}{n-k-1} \quad \text{ou} \quad e^{(\Omega)} = M^{(\Omega)} \xi^{(\Omega)}$$

$$\xi^{(\Omega)} \sim N(0, \sigma^2 I_n)$$

$$k = \frac{(n-k-1) S^2}{\sigma^2} = \frac{\xi^{(\Omega)'} M^{(\Omega)'} M^{(\Omega)} \xi^{(\Omega)}}{\sigma^2} = \frac{\xi^{(\Omega)'} M^{(\Omega)} \xi^{(\Omega)}}{\sigma^2}$$

$$\sim \chi^2_{\text{tr}(M(\Omega))} \text{ où } \text{tr}(M(\Omega)) = n - (k+1)$$

$$(3) \hat{\beta}_{GLS} \sim N_{k+1}(\beta, \sigma^2 V) \quad V = (X' \Omega^{-1} X)^{-1}$$

$$\Rightarrow Z = \frac{V^{-\frac{1}{2}} (\hat{\beta}_{GLS} - \beta)}{\sigma} \sim N_{k+1}(0, I_{k+1})$$

$$\text{Let } K_1 = Z'Z = \frac{(\hat{\beta}_{GLS} - \beta)' V^{-1} (\hat{\beta}_{GLS} - \beta)}{\sigma^2} \sim \chi^2_{k+1}$$

$$K_2 = \frac{(n-k-1)S^2}{\sigma^2} \sim \chi^2_{n-k-1}$$

K_1, K_2 independant,

$$F = \frac{K_1 / (k+1)}{K_2 / (n-k-1)} = \frac{(\hat{\beta}_{GLS} - \beta)' X' \Omega^{-1} X (\hat{\beta}_{GLS} - \beta)}{(k+1)S^2} \sim F_{k+1, n-k-1}$$

ou

$$F = \frac{(C \hat{\beta}_{GLS} - \beta)' X' \Omega^{-1} X (C \hat{\beta}_{GLS} - \beta)}{(k+1)S^2} \sim F_{k+1, n-k-1}$$

avec $C = I_{k+1}$. C dim $m \times (k+1)$

$$C\hat{\beta}_{GLS} \sim N_m(C\beta, \sigma^2 C(X'\Omega^{-1}X)^{-1}C')$$

$$\Rightarrow C\hat{\beta}_{GLS} - C\beta \sim N_m(0, \sigma^2 G), \quad G = C(X'\Omega^{-1}X)^{-1}C'$$

$$\Rightarrow Z = \frac{G^{-\frac{1}{2}}(C\hat{\beta}_{GLS} - C\beta)}{\sigma} \sim N_m(0, I_m)$$

$$\text{Let } k_1 = Z'Z = \frac{(C\hat{\beta}_{GLS} - C\beta)' G^{-1} (C\hat{\beta}_{GLS} - C\beta)}{\sigma^2}$$

$$\sim \chi_m^2$$

$$\Rightarrow F = \frac{k_1/m}{k_2/(n-k-1)} = \frac{(C\hat{\beta}_{GLS} - C\beta)' \overset{G^{-1}}{[C(X'\Omega^{-1}X)^{-1}C']^{-1}} (C\hat{\beta}_{GLS} - C\beta)}{ms^2}$$

$$\sim F_{m, n-k-1}$$

$$H_0: C\beta = d$$

$$F = \frac{(C\hat{\beta}_{GLS} - d)' [C(X'\Omega^{-1}X)^{-1}C']^{-1} (C\hat{\beta}_{GLS} - d)}{ms^2} \sim F_{m, n-k-1; \alpha}$$

Estimated Generalized Least Squares: unknown Ω .

The matrix is not usually known and needs to be estimated. If $\hat{\Omega}$ is an estimated of Ω , then

$$\hat{\beta}_{EGLS} = (X' \hat{\Omega}^{-1} X)^{-1} X' \hat{\Omega}^{-1} y$$

has been called an estimated generalized least squares estimate.

General asymptotic properties are available:

(1) $\hat{\beta}_{GLS}$ and $\hat{\beta}_{EGLS}$ are both consistent and have the same asymptotic distribution.

(2) Both estimates are asymptotically normal with mean β and covariance matrix

$$\frac{\sigma^2 \Phi^{-1}}{n}$$

$$(3) \frac{\hat{\beta}_{GLS} - \hat{\beta}_{EGLS}}{\sqrt{n}} \xrightarrow{P} 0$$

(4) Under some further conditions,

$$\hat{\sigma}^2 = \frac{(y - X\hat{\beta}_{EGLS})' \hat{\Omega}^{-1} (y - X\hat{\beta}_{EGLS})}{n-k-1} \xrightarrow{P} \sigma^2$$

special case: error variance unequal and unknown

A special case where we need to consider empirical estimation of Ω occurs when the non-diagonal elements of Ω are zero and the diagonal elements are unknown.

i.e. $\Omega = \text{diag}(\sigma_1^2, \sigma_2^2, \dots, \sigma_n^2)$

and the σ^2 are unknown.

This is case of heteroscedasticity with unknown variances.

Estimation procedure

- Suppose we apply ordinary least squares and obtain the vector e of residuals e_i .

It is reasonable to base any estimation of σ_i^2 on these residuals. $e = y - X\hat{\beta}$

- A standard method consists of considering

$$e^{(2)} = (e_1^2, e_2^2, \dots, e_n^2)'$$

$$\text{Since } e = M\varepsilon, \quad M = I - X(X'X)^{-1}X'$$

$$e_i = \sum_{j=1}^n m_{ij} \cdot \varepsilon_j, \quad E[\varepsilon_i \varepsilon_j] = \sigma_j^2 \delta_{ij}$$

$$\delta_{ij} = \begin{cases} 1 & \text{if } i=j \\ 0 & \text{if } i \neq j \end{cases}$$

$$E(e_i^2) = \sum_{j=1}^n m_{ij}^2 \sigma_j^2$$

$$\text{Let } M^{(2)} = (m_{ij}^2) \text{ and } \sigma^{(2)} = (\sigma_1^2, \sigma_2^2, \dots, \sigma_n^2)'$$

$$E(e^{(2)}) = M^{(2)} \sigma^{(2)}$$

Replacing $E(e^{(2)})$ by its estimates $e^{(2)}$ and $\sigma^{(2)}$ by its estimates $\hat{\sigma}^{(2)} = (\hat{\sigma}_1^2, \hat{\sigma}_2^2, \dots, \hat{\sigma}_n^2)$

We get $e^{(2)} = M^{(2)} \cdot \hat{\sigma}^{(2)}$

We can solve this set of equations to get the required estimates $\hat{\sigma}_i^2$.

These estimates are also known to be MINQUE.

* A major difficulty with these estimates is that some $\hat{\sigma}_i^2$ can turn out to be negative.

Although, it is not desirable to estimate individual σ_i^2 in this way, the method can be useful if there is a relationship among the σ_i^2 's

Assume that $\sigma_i^2 = Z_i' \alpha$, $\sigma^2 \Omega = \text{diag}(Z_1' \alpha, \dots, Z_n' \alpha)$

Z_i is an m -dimensional known vector

α is a vector of parameters.

Let $\underline{z}' = (z_1, \dots, z_n)$, $E(e^{(2)}) = M^{(2)} z \alpha$,

which prompts the estimation of α as

$$\hat{\alpha} = (z' M^{(2)'} M^{(2)} z)^{-1} z' M^{(2)} e^{(2)}$$

$$\hat{\sigma}_i^2 = z_i' \hat{\alpha}$$

which in turn can be used to estimate σ_i^2 's

Since $(M^{(2)})^{-1} E(e^{(2)}) = z \alpha$.

Another estimate of α is

$$\hat{\alpha} = (z' z)^{-1} z' (M^{(2)})^{-1} e^{(2)}$$

Yet another alternative (MINQUE, Froehlich, 1973).

$$\hat{\alpha} = (z' M^{(2)} z)^{-1} z' e^{(2)}$$

ex: $y_i = \beta_0 + (\beta_1 + \delta_i) x_i + \epsilon_i$

$$\Rightarrow y_i = \beta_0 + \beta_1 x_i + \delta_i x_i + \epsilon_i$$

Suppose that δ_i i.i.d $E(\delta_i) = 0$, $\text{var}(\delta_i) = \varphi^2$

ϵ_i i.i.d $E(\epsilon_i) = 0$, $\text{var}(\epsilon_i) = \sigma^2$

ϵ and δ are independent.

$$y_i = \beta_0 + \beta_1 x_i + \varepsilon_i, \quad E(\varepsilon_i) = 0, \\ \text{var}(\varepsilon_i) = \varphi^2 x_i^2 + \sigma^2 \\ = \underbrace{[1 \quad x_i^2]}_{Z_i'} \underbrace{\begin{bmatrix} \sigma^2 \\ \varphi^2 \end{bmatrix}}_{\alpha}$$

obtain $\hat{\alpha} \rightarrow$ OLS $\rightarrow w_i = \frac{1}{\text{var}(\varepsilon_i)} = \frac{1}{Z_i' \hat{\alpha}}$

$\rightarrow \hat{\beta}$ EGLS

Serial Correlation.*

Frequently when the observations y_i are taken over successive time intervals, the ε_i 's are correlated.

This type of correlation is called serial correlation.

We consider the particular case when the ε_i 's follow a first order autoregressive process:

$$\varepsilon_t = \rho \varepsilon_{t-1} + \eta_t.$$

$$y = X\beta + \varepsilon. \quad E(\varepsilon) = 0. \quad \text{Cov}(\varepsilon^2) = \sigma^2 \Omega$$

where $|\rho| < 1$ and $\forall t=1, \dots, n$. η_t 's are independent and identically distributed with mean 0 and variance σ^2 . $\text{Cov}(\eta_i, \eta_j) = \sigma^2 \delta_{ij}$

$$E(\varepsilon_t) = 0. \quad \text{var}(\varepsilon_t) = \frac{\sigma^2}{1-\rho^2}$$

$$\sigma^2 \Omega = \frac{\sigma^2}{1-\rho^2} \begin{bmatrix} 1 & \rho & \rho^2 & \dots & \rho^{n-1} \\ \rho & & & & \vdots \\ \vdots & & & & \\ \rho^{n-1} & \dots & & & 1 \end{bmatrix}$$

$$\hat{\rho} = \frac{\sum_{t=2}^n l_t l_{t-1}}{\sum_{t=2}^n l_{t-1}^2} \rightarrow \hat{\Omega}$$

$$\hat{\beta}_{EGLS} = (X' \hat{\Omega}^{-1} X)^{-1} X' \hat{\Omega}^{-1} y.$$

7.5 The Growth Curve Model

When nothing is known of the form of Ω , it is still possible to estimate it, if the experiment can be replicated an adequate number of times, i.e., if we have the model

$$\mathbf{y}_t = X\boldsymbol{\beta} + \boldsymbol{\epsilon}_t$$

where X is an $m \times p$ matrix, $t = 1, 2, \dots, M$, $E(\boldsymbol{\epsilon}_t) = \mathbf{0}$ and $\text{cov}(\boldsymbol{\epsilon}_t) = \Omega$. Here $\mathbf{y}_1, \dots, \mathbf{y}_M$ are independent m dimensional vectors and σ^2 has been absorbed in Ω .

Let $\bar{\mathbf{y}} = M^{-1} \sum_{t=1}^M \mathbf{y}_t$ and $\bar{\boldsymbol{\epsilon}} = M^{-1} \sum_{t=1}^M \boldsymbol{\epsilon}_t$. Then

$$\bar{\mathbf{y}} = X\boldsymbol{\beta} + \bar{\boldsymbol{\epsilon}}$$

where $E(\bar{\boldsymbol{\epsilon}}) = \mathbf{0}$ and $\text{cov}(\bar{\mathbf{y}}) = \text{cov}(\bar{\boldsymbol{\epsilon}}) = M^{-1}\Omega$. Hence, the generalized least squares estimate of $\boldsymbol{\beta}$ is given by

$$\mathbf{b}_{GLS} = (X'\Omega^{-1}X)^{-1}X'\Omega^{-1}\bar{\mathbf{y}}.$$

However, Ω is not known. But since $E(\mathbf{y}_t - \bar{\mathbf{y}}) = 0$, for all $t = 1, \dots, M$, an unbiased estimator of Ω is given by

$$\hat{\Omega} = (M - 1)^{-1} \sum_{t=1}^M (\mathbf{y}_t - \bar{\mathbf{y}})(\mathbf{y}_t - \bar{\mathbf{y}})'$$

Therefore, an estimated generalized least squares estimate of $\boldsymbol{\beta}$ is

$$\mathbf{b}_{EGLS} = (X'\hat{\Omega}^{-1}X)^{-1}X'\hat{\Omega}^{-1}\bar{\mathbf{y}}.$$

Under the assumption that $\boldsymbol{\epsilon}_t$ is multivariate normal, it can be shown that this \mathbf{b}_{EGLS} is an unbiased estimator (see Exercise 7.3).

Under normality, the hypothesis $H : C\boldsymbol{\beta} = 0$ against $A : C\boldsymbol{\beta} \neq 0$ (where C is $r \times p$ dimensional with $r \leq p$) is rejected if

$$\frac{M - r - m + p}{(M - 1)r} \frac{\mathbf{b}'_{EGLS} C' (C E C')^{-1} C \mathbf{b}_{EGLS}}{1 + (M - 1)^{-1} T^2} > F_{r, M-r-m+p, \alpha}$$

where $E = (X'\hat{\Omega}^{-1}X)^{-1}$, $T^2 = M\bar{\mathbf{y}}'G'(G\hat{\Omega}G')^{-1}G\bar{\mathbf{y}}$ and $G : (m-p) \times m$ is such that $GX = 0$. Alternatively, if it is inconvenient to find a suitable G , one could use $T^2 = M\bar{\mathbf{y}}'[\hat{\Omega}^{-1} - \hat{\Omega}^{-1}X(X'\hat{\Omega}^{-1}X)^{-1}X'\hat{\Omega}^{-1}]\bar{\mathbf{y}}$. (This result is obtained with the help of Lemma A.1, p. 279, of Appendix A).

Example 7.1

Exhibit 7.1 shows dental measurements for girls from 8 to 14 years old. Each measurement is the distance, in millimeters, from the center of the pituitary to the ptery-maxillary fissure. Suppose we wish to relate these measurements to age and write our model as

$$y_{ts} = \beta_0 + \beta_1 x_{t1} + \epsilon_{ts},$$

where $x_{t1} = \text{age} - 11$. Then

$$X = \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 \\ -3 & -1 & 1 & 3 \end{pmatrix}'.$$

Clearly, for the same subject s the $m = 4$ measurements y_t are not independent and

$$\text{cov}(\epsilon_s) = \Omega, \text{ where } \epsilon_s = (\epsilon_{1s}, \dots, \epsilon_{4s})'.$$

However, we have $M = 11$ replications of the experiment.

Age in Years	Subjects										
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11
8	21.0	21.0	20.5	23.5	21.5	20.0	21.5	23.0	20.0	16.5	24.5
10	20.0	21.5	24.0	24.5	23.0	21.0	22.5	23.0	21.0	19.0	25.0
12	21.5	24.0	24.5	25.0	22.5	21.0	23.0	23.5	22.0	19.0	28.0
14	23.0	25.5	26.0	26.5	23.5	22.5	25.0	24.0	21.5	19.5	28.0

EXHIBIT 7.1: Data on Dental Measurements

SOURCE: Pothoff and Roy (1964). Reproduced from *Biometrika* with the permission of Biometrika Trustees.

Since $\bar{\mathbf{y}} = (21.2, 22.2, 23.1, 24.1)'$, an estimate of Ω is given by $\hat{\Omega} = \sum_{i=1}^{11} (\mathbf{y}_i - \bar{\mathbf{y}})(\mathbf{y}_i - \bar{\mathbf{y}})' / 10$

$$= \begin{pmatrix} 4.51 & 3.36 & 4.43 & 4.36 \\ 3.36 & 3.62 & 4.02 & 4.08 \\ 4.33 & 4.03 & 5.59 & 5.47 \\ 4.36 & 4.08 & 5.47 & 5.94 \end{pmatrix}.$$

Hence

$$\mathbf{b}_{EGLS} = (X'\hat{\Omega}^{-1}X)^{-1}X'\hat{\Omega}^{-1}\bar{\mathbf{y}} = \begin{pmatrix} 22.70 \\ 0.482 \end{pmatrix}.$$

Suppose we wish to test the hypothesis that the linear term is zero. That is, $H : \beta_1 = 0$ against $A : \beta_1 \neq 0$. In this case, $C = (0, 1)$, $r = 1$, $p = 2$ and

$$E = (X'\hat{\Omega}^{-1}X)^{-1} = \begin{pmatrix} 3.807 & 0.160 \\ -0.160 & 0.160 \end{pmatrix}$$

and $CEC' = 0.045$. The matrix

$$G = \begin{pmatrix} 1 & -1 & -1 & 1 \\ -1 & 3 & -3 & 1 \end{pmatrix}$$

is such that $GX = 0$. Therefore, $T^2 = 11\bar{\mathbf{y}}'G'(G\hat{\Omega}G')^{-1}G\bar{\mathbf{y}} = 0.11$ and

$$F = \frac{M - r - m + p}{(M - 1)r} \frac{\mathbf{b}'_{EGLS}C'(CEC')^{-1}C\mathbf{b}_{EGLS}}{1 + T^2/10} = 45.94.$$

Therefore, at 1 and 8 degrees of freedom, we reject the hypothesis at a 5 per cent level. ■